MEMORANDUM

TO:        Board of Clark County Councilors
FROM:      Steve Morasch, Planning Commission Chair
           Oliver Orjiako, Director
DATE:      October 6, 2015
SUBJECT:   Criteria for Choosing a Preferred Alternative

The draft supplemental environmental impact statement (DSEIS) on the 2016 Comprehensive Plan update alternatives was released on August 5, 2015. The comment period ended September 17, 2015. Joint hearings were held on September 3 and 10 with the Board of County Councilors (Board) and the Planning Commission for the purpose of taking testimony on the four alternatives that were analyzed in the DSEIS. The Planning Commission deliberated on September 17, 2015 and made a recommendation on a preferred alternative to the Board which is attached as Exhibit C.

The Board will deliberate and decide on a preferred alternative at a hearing scheduled for October 20, 2015. The preferred alternative is analyzed in a final SEIS (FSEIS) and work commences on the capital facilities planning needed to support the preferred alternative.

There are a number of factors that need to be considered in developing a preferred alternative. Some of these standards and criteria are outlined below, but be aware that the list below is not exclusive, and that consideration of additional standards may be required.

First and foremost, the preferred alternative must be consistent with the Growth Management Act (GMA), including its specific provisions, the more general goals, and the Washington Administrative Code provisions that implement the GMA.

GMA GOALS

The goals are listed as follows:
RCW 36.70A.020 Planning Goals.

(1) Urban growth. Encourage development in urban areas where adequate public facilities and services exist or can be provided in an efficient manner.

(2) Reduce sprawl. Reduce the inappropriate conversion of undeveloped land into sprawling, low-density development.

(3) Transportation. Encourage efficient multimodal transportation systems that are based on regional priorities and coordinated with county and city comprehensive plans.

(4) Housing. Encourage the availability of affordable housing to all economic segments of the population of this state, promote a variety of residential densities and housing types, and encourage preservation of existing housing stock.

(5) Economic development. Encourage economic development throughout the state that is consistent with adopted comprehensive plans, promote economic opportunity for all citizens of this state, especially for unemployed and for disadvantaged persons, promote the retention and expansion of existing businesses and recruitment of new businesses, recognize regional differences impacting economic development opportunities, and encourage growth in areas experiencing insufficient economic growth, all within the capacities of the state’s natural resources, public services, and public facilities.

(6) Property rights. Private property shall not be taken for public use without just compensation having been made. The property rights of landowners shall be protected from arbitrary and discriminatory actions.

(7) Permits. Applications for both state and local government permits should be processed in a timely and fair manner to ensure predictability.

(8) Natural resource industries. Maintain and enhance natural resource-based industries, including productive timber, agricultural, and fisheries industries. Encourage the conservation of productive forest lands and productive agricultural lands, and discourage incompatible uses.

(9) Open space and recreation. Retain open space, enhance recreational opportunities, conserve fish and wildlife habitat, increase access to natural resource lands and water, and develop parks and recreation facilities.

(10) Environment. Protect the environment and enhance the state's high quality of life, including air and water quality, and the availability of water.

(11) Citizen participation and coordination. Encourage the involvement of citizens in the planning process and ensure coordination between communities and jurisdictions to reconcile conflicts.
(12) Public facilities and services. Ensure that those public facilities and services necessary to support development shall be adequate to serve the development at the time the development is available for occupancy and use without decreasing current service levels below locally established minimum standards.

(13) Historic preservation. Identify and encourage the preservation of lands, sites, and structures that have historical or archaeological significance.

In addition, **RCW 36.70A.480(1)** states that: For shorelines of the state, the goals and policies of the shoreline management act as set forth in RCW 90.58.020 are added as one of the goals of this chapter as set forth in RCW 36.70A.020 without creating an order of priority among the fourteen goals. The goals and policies of a shoreline master program for a county or city approved under chapter 90.58 RCW shall be considered an element of the county or city's comprehensive plan. All other portions of the shoreline master program for a county or city adopted under chapter 90.58 RCW, including use regulations, shall be considered a part of the county or city's development regulations.

**OTHER GMA REQUIREMENTS IN STATUTES AND REGULATIONS**

**RCW 36.70A.110 Comprehensive plans — Urban growth areas.**

(1) Each county that is required or chooses to plan under RCW 36.70A.040 shall designate an urban growth area or areas within which urban growth shall be encouraged and outside of which growth can occur only if it is not urban in nature. Each city that is located in such a county shall be included within an urban growth area. An urban growth area may include more than a single city. An urban growth area may include territory that is located outside of a city only if such territory already is characterized by urban growth whether or not the urban growth area includes a city, or is adjacent to territory already characterized by urban growth, or is a designated new fully contained community as defined by RCW 36.70A.350.

(2) Based upon the growth management population projection made for the county by the office of financial management, the county and each city within the county shall include areas and densities sufficient to permit the urban growth that is projected to occur in the county or city for the succeeding twenty-year period, except for those urban growth areas contained totally within a national historical reserve. As part of this planning process, each city within the county must include areas sufficient to accommodate the broad range of needs and uses that will accompany the projected urban growth including, as appropriate, medical, governmental, institutional, commercial, service, retail, and other nonresidential uses.

Each urban growth area shall permit urban densities and shall include greenbelt and open space areas. In the case of urban growth areas contained totally within a national historical reserve, the city may restrict densities, intensities, and forms of urban growth
as determined to be necessary and appropriate to protect the physical, cultural, or historic integrity of the reserve. An urban growth area determination may include a reasonable land market supply factor and shall permit a range of urban densities and uses. In determining this market factor, cities and counties may consider local circumstances. Cities and counties have discretion in their comprehensive plans to make many choices about accommodating growth.

* * * *

(3) Urban growth should be located first in areas already characterized by urban growth that have adequate existing public facility and service capacities to serve such development, second in areas already characterized by urban growth that will be served adequately by a combination of both existing public facilities and services and any additional needed public facilities and services that are provided by either public or private sources, and third in the remaining portions of the urban growth areas. Urban growth may also be located in designated new fully contained communities as defined by RCW 36.70A.350.

(4) In general, cities are the units of local government most appropriate to provide urban governmental services. In general, it is not appropriate that urban governmental services be extended to or expanded in rural areas except in those limited circumstances shown to be necessary to protect basic public health and safety and the environment and when such services are financially supportable at rural densities and do not permit urban development.

RCW 36.70A.060 Natural resource lands and critical areas — Development regulations.

(1)(a) Each county that is required or chooses to plan under RCW 36.70A.040, and each city within such county, shall adopt development regulations on or before September 1, 1991, to assure the conservation of agricultural, forest, and mineral resource lands designated under RCW 36.70A.170

RCW 36.70A.030 Definitions.

(15) "Rural character" refers to the patterns of land use and development established by a county in the rural element of its comprehensive plan:

(a) In which open space, the natural landscape, and vegetation predominate over the built environment;

(b) That foster traditional rural lifestyles, rural-based economies, and opportunities to both live and work in rural areas;

(c) That provide visual landscapes that are traditionally found in rural areas and communities;
(d) That are compatible with the use of the land by wildlife and for fish and wildlife habitat;

(e) That reduce the inappropriate conversion of undeveloped land into sprawling, low-density development;

(f) That generally do not require the extension of urban governmental services; and

(g) That are consistent with the protection of natural surface water flows and groundwater and surface water recharge and discharge areas.

(16) "Rural development" refers to development outside the urban growth area and outside agricultural, forest, and mineral resource lands designated pursuant to RCW 36.70A.170. Rural development can consist of a variety of uses and residential densities, including clustered residential development, at levels that are consistent with the preservation of rural character and the requirements of the rural element. Rural development does not refer to agriculture or forestry activities that may be conducted in rural areas.

(17) "Rural governmental services" or "rural services" include those public services and public facilities historically and typically delivered at an intensity usually found in rural areas, and may include domestic water systems, fire and police protection services, transportation and public transit services, and other public utilities associated with rural development and normally not associated with urban areas. Rural services do not include storm or sanitary sewers, except as otherwise authorized by RCW 36.70A.110(4).

RCW 36.70A.070 Comprehensive plans—Mandatory elements.

****

(5) Rural element. Counties shall include a rural element including lands that are not designated for urban growth, agriculture, forest, or mineral resources. The following provisions shall apply to the rural element:

   (a) Growth management act goals and local circumstances. Because circumstances vary from county to county, in establishing patterns of rural densities and uses, a county may consider local circumstances, but shall develop a written record explaining how the rural element harmonizes the planning goals in RCW 36.70A.020 and meets the requirements of this chapter.

   (b) Rural development. The rural element shall permit rural development, forestry, and agriculture in rural areas. The rural element shall provide for a variety of rural densities, uses, essential public facilities, and rural governmental services needed to serve the permitted densities and uses. To achieve a variety of rural densities and uses, counties may provide for clustering, density transfer, design guidelines, conservation easements, and other innovative techniques that will accommodate appropriate rural densities and uses that are not characterized by urban growth and that are consistent with rural character.
(c) Measures governing rural development. The rural element shall include measures that apply to rural development and protect the rural character of the area, as established by the county, by:

(i) Containing or otherwise controlling rural development;
(ii) Assuring visual compatibility of rural development with the surrounding rural area;
(iii) Reducing the inappropriate conversion of undeveloped land into sprawling, low-density development in the rural area;
(iv) Protecting critical areas, as provided in RCW 36.70A.060, and surface water and groundwater resources; and
(v) Protecting against conflicts with the use of agricultural, forest, and mineral resource lands designated under RCW 36.70A.170.

WAC 365-190-030 Definitions.

(1) "Agricultural land" is land primarily devoted to the commercial production of horticultural, viticultural, floricultural, dairy, apiary, vegetable, or animal products or of berries, grain, hay, straw, turf, seed, Christmas trees not subject to the excise tax imposed by RCW 84.33.100 through 84.33.140, finfish in upland hatcheries, or livestock, and that has long-term commercial significance for agricultural production. These lands are referred to in this chapter as agricultural resource lands to distinguish between formally designated lands, and other lands used for agricultural purposes.

****

(11) "Long-term commercial significance" includes the growing capacity, productivity, and soil composition of the land for long-term commercial production, in consideration with the land’s proximity to population areas, and the possibility of more intense uses of land. Long-term commercial significance means the land is capable of producing the specified natural resources at commercially sustainable levels for at least the twenty-year planning period, if adequately conserved. Designated mineral resource lands of long-term commercial significance may have alternative post-mining land uses, as provided by the Surface Mining Reclamation Act, comprehensive plan and development regulations, or other laws.

WAC 365-190-050 Agricultural resource lands.

(1) In classifying and designating agricultural resource lands, counties must approach the effort as a county-wide or area-wide process. Counties and cities should not review resource lands designations solely on a parcel-by-parcel process. Counties and cities must have a program for the transfer or purchase of development rights prior to designating agricultural resource lands in urban growth areas. Cities are encouraged to coordinate their agricultural resource lands designations with their county and any adjacent jurisdictions.
(2) Once lands are designated, counties and cities planning under the act must adopt development regulations that assure the conservation of agricultural resource lands. Recommendations for those regulations are found in WAC 365-196-815.

(3) Lands should be considered for designation as agricultural resource lands based on three factors:

(a) The land is not already characterized by urban growth. To evaluate this factor, counties and cities should use the criteria contained in WAC 365-196-310.

(b) The land is used or capable of being used for agricultural production. This factor evaluates whether lands are well suited to agricultural use based primarily on their physical and geographic characteristics. Some agricultural operations are less dependent on soil quality than others, including some livestock production operations.

(i) Lands that are currently used for agricultural production and lands that are capable of such use must be evaluated for designation. The intent of a landowner to use land for agriculture or to cease such use is not the controlling factor in determining if land is used or capable of being used for agricultural production. Land enrolled in federal conservation reserve programs is recommended for designation based on previous agricultural use, management requirements, and potential for reuse as agricultural land.

(ii) In determining whether lands are used or capable of being used for agricultural production, counties and cities shall use the land-capability classification system of the United States Department of Agriculture Natural Resources Conservation Service as defined in relevant Field Office Technical Guides. These eight classes are incorporated by the United States Department of Agriculture into map units described in published soil surveys, and are based on the growing capacity, productivity and soil composition of the land.

(c) The land has long-term commercial significance for agriculture. In determining this factor, counties and cities should consider the following nonexclusive criteria, as applicable:

(i) The classification of prime and unique farmland soils as mapped by the Natural Resources Conservation Service;

(ii) The availability of public facilities, including roads used in transporting agricultural products;

(iii) Tax status, including whether lands are enrolled under the current use tax assessment under chapter 84.34 RCW and whether the optional public benefit rating
system is used locally, and whether there is the ability to purchase or transfer land development rights;

(iv) The availability of public services;

(v) Relationship or proximity to urban growth areas;

(vi) Predominant parcel size;

(vii) Land use settlement patterns and their compatibility with agricultural practices;

(viii) Intensity of nearby land uses;

(ix) History of land development permits issued nearby;

(x) Land values under alternative uses; and

(xi) Proximity to markets.

(4) When designating agricultural resource lands, counties and cities may consider food security issues, which may include providing local food supplies for food banks, schools and institutions, vocational training opportunities in agricultural operations, and preserving heritage or artisanal foods.

(5) When applying the criteria in subsection (3)(c) of this section, the process should result in designating an amount of agricultural resource lands sufficient to maintain and enhance the economic viability of the agricultural industry in the county over the long term; and to retain supporting agricultural businesses, such as processors, farm suppliers, and equipment maintenance and repair facilities.

(6) Counties and cities may further classify additional agricultural lands of local importance. Classifying additional agricultural lands of local importance should include, in addition to general public involvement, consultation with the board of the local conservation district and the local committee of the farm service agency. It may also be useful to consult with any existing local organizations marketing or using local produce, including the boards of local farmers markets, school districts, other large institutions, such as hospitals, correctional facilities, or existing food cooperatives.

These additional lands may include designated critical areas, such as bogs used to grow cranberries or farmed wetlands. Where these lands are also designated critical areas, counties and cities planning under the act must weigh the compatibility of adjacent land uses and development with the continuing need to protect the functions and values of critical areas and ecosystems.
WAC 365-190-060 Forest resource lands.

(1) In classifying and designating forest resource lands, counties must approach the effort as a county-wide or regional process. Cities are encouraged to coordinate their forest resource lands designations with their county and any adjacent jurisdictions. Counties and cities should not review forest resource lands designations solely on a parcel-by-parcel basis.

(2) Lands should be designated as forest resource lands of long-term commercial significance based on three factors:

(a) The land is not already characterized by urban growth. To evaluate this factor, counties and cities should use the criteria contained in WAC 365-196-310.

(b) The land is used or capable of being used for forestry production. To evaluate this factor, counties and cities should determine whether lands are well suited for forestry use based primarily on their physical and geographic characteristics.

Lands that are currently used for forestry production and lands that are capable of such use must be evaluated for designation. The landowner's intent to either use land for forestry or to cease such use is not the controlling factor in determining if land is used or capable of being used for forestry production.

(c) The land has long-term commercial significance. When determining whether lands are used or capable of being used for forestry production, counties and cities should determine which land grade constitutes forest land of long-term commercial significance, based on local physical, biological, economic, and land use considerations. Counties and cities should use the private forest land grades of the department of revenue (WAC 458-40-530). This system incorporates consideration of growing capacity, productivity, and soil composition of the land. Forest land of long-term commercial significance will generally have a predominance of the higher private forest land grades. However, the presence of lower private forest land grades within the areas of predominantly higher grades need not preclude designation as forest land.

(3) Counties and cities may also consider secondary benefits from retaining commercial forestry operations. Benefits from retaining commercial forestry may include protecting air and water quality, maintaining adequate aquifer recharge areas, reducing forest fire risks, supporting tourism and access to recreational opportunities, providing carbon sequestration benefits, and improving wildlife habitat and connectivity for upland species. These are only potential secondary benefits from retaining commercial forestry operations, and should not be used alone as a basis for designating or dedesignating forest resource lands.
(4) Counties and cities must also consider the effects of proximity to population areas and the possibility of more intense uses of the land as indicated by the following criteria as applicable:

(a) The availability of public services and facilities conducive to the conversion of forest land;

(b) The proximity of forest land to urban and suburban areas and rural settlements: Forest lands of long-term commercial significance are located outside the urban and suburban areas and rural settlements;

(c) The size of the parcels: Forest lands consist of predominantly large parcels;

(d) The compatibility and intensity of adjacent and nearby land use and settlement patterns with forest lands of long-term commercial significance;

(e) Property tax classification: Property is assessed as open space or forest land pursuant to chapter 84.33 or 84.34 RCW;

(f) Local economic conditions which affect the ability to manage timberlands for long-term commercial production; and

(g) History of land development permits issued nearby.

(5) When applying the criteria in subsection (4) of this section, counties or cities should designate at least the minimum amount of forest resource lands needed to maintain economic viability for the forestry industry and to retain supporting forestry businesses, such as loggers, mills, forest product processors, equipment suppliers, and equipment maintenance and repair facilities. Economic viability in this context is that amount of designated forestry resource land needed to maintain economic viability of the forestry industry in the region over the long term.

365-196-425 Rural element.

****

(3) Rural densities.

(a) The rural element should provide for a variety of densities that are consistent with the pattern of development established in its definition of rural character. The rural comprehensive plan designations should be shown on the future land use map. Rural densities are a range of densities that:

(i) Are compatible with the primary use of land for natural resource production;

(ii) Do not make intensive use of the land;
(iii) Allow open space, the natural landscape, and vegetation to predominate over the built environment;

(iv) Foster traditional rural lifestyles, rural-based economies, and opportunities to both live and work in rural areas;

(v) Provide visual landscapes that are traditionally found in rural areas and communities;

(vi) Are compatible with the use of the land by wildlife and for fish and wildlife habitat;

(vii) Reduce the inappropriate conversion of undeveloped land into sprawling, low-density development;

(viii) Generally do not require the extension of urban governmental services;

(ix) Are consistent with the protection of natural surface water flows and ground water and surface water recharge and discharge areas; and

(x) Do not create urban densities in rural areas or abrogate the county's responsibility to encourage new development in urban areas.

(b) Counties should perform a periodic analysis of development occurring in rural areas, to determine if patterns of rural development are protecting rural character and encouraging development in urban areas. This analysis should occur along with the urban growth area review required in RCW 36.70A.130 (3)(a). The analysis may include the following:

(i) Patterns of development occurring in rural areas.

(ii) The percentage of new growth occurring in rural versus urban areas.

(iii) Patterns of rural comprehensive plan or zoning amendments.

(iv) Numbers of permits issued in rural areas.

(v) Numbers of new approved wells and septic systems.

(vi) Growth in traffic levels on rural roads.

(vii) Growth in public facilities and public services costs in rural areas.

(viii) Changes in rural land values and rural employment.

(ix) Potential build-out at the allowed rural densities.
(x) The degree to which the growth that is occurring in the rural areas is consistent with patterns of rural land use and development established in the rural element.

****(5) Innovative zoning techniques.

(a) Innovative zoning techniques allow greater flexibility in rural development regulations to create forms of development that are more consistent with rural character than forms of development generated by conventional large-lot zoning. Innovative zoning techniques may allow forms of rural development that:

(i) Result in rural development that is more visually compatible with the surrounding rural areas;

(ii) Maximize the availability of rural land for either resource use or wildlife habitat;

(iii) Increase the operational compatibility of the rural development with use of the land for resource production;

(iv) Decrease the impact of the rural development on the surrounding ecosystem;

(v) Does not allow urban growth; and

(vi) Does not require the extension of urban governmental services.

(b) Rural clusters. One common form of innovative zoning technique is the rural cluster. A rural cluster can create smaller individual lots than would normally be allowed in exchange for open space that preserves a significant portion of the original parcel.

(i) When calculating the density of development for zoning purposes, counties should calculate density based on the number of dwelling units over the entire development parcel, rather than the size of the individual lots created.

(ii) The open space portion of the original parcel should be held by an easement, parcel or tract for open space or resource use. This should be held in perpetuity, without an expiration date.

(iii) If a county allows bonus densities in a rural cluster, the resulting density after applying the bonus must be a rural density.

(iv) Rural clusters may not create a pattern of development that relies on or requires urban governmental services. Counties should establish a limit on the size of the residential cluster so that a cluster does not constitute urban growth in a rural area. A very large project may create multiple smaller clusters that are separated from each other and use a different access point to avoid creating a pattern of development that would constitute urban growth.
(v) Development regulations governing rural clusters should include design criteria that preserve rural visual character.

(6) Limited areas of more intense rural development. The act allows counties to plan for isolated pockets of more intense development in the rural area. These are referred to in the act as limited areas of more intense rural development or LAMIRDs.

(a) LAMIRDs serve the following purposes:

(i) To recognize existing areas of more intense rural development and to minimize and contain these areas to prevent low density sprawl;

(ii) To allow for small-scale commercial uses that rely on a rural location;

(iii) To allow for small-scale economic development and employment consistent with rural character; and

(iv) To allow for redevelopment of existing industrial areas within rural areas.

(b) An existing area or existing use is one that was in existence on the date the county became subject to all of the provisions of the act:

(i) For a county initially required to fully plan under the act, on July 1, 1990.

(ii) For a county that chooses to fully plan under the act, on the date the county adopted the resolution under RCW 36.70A.040(2).

(iii) For a county that becomes subject to all of the requirements of the act under RCW 36.70A.040(5), on the date the office of financial management certifies the county’s population.

(c) Counties may allow for more intensive uses in a LAMIRD than would otherwise be allowed in rural areas and may allow public facilities and services that are appropriate and necessary to serve LAMIRDs subject to the following requirements:

(i) Type 1 LAMIRDs - Isolated areas of existing more intense development. Within these areas, rural development consists of infill, development, or redevelopment of existing areas. These areas may include a variety of uses including commercial, industrial, residential, or mixed-use areas. These may be also characterized as shoreline development, villages, hamlets, rural activity centers, or crossroads developments.

(A) Development or redevelopment in LAMIRDs may be both allowed and encouraged provided it is consistent with the character of the existing LAMIRD in terms
of building size, scale, use, and intensity. Counties may allow new uses of property within a LAMIRD, including development of vacant land.

(B) When establishing a Type I LAMIRD, counties must establish a logical outer boundary. The purpose of the logical outer boundary is to minimize and contain the areas of more intensive rural development to the existing areas. Uses, densities or intensities not normally allowed in a rural area may be allowed inside the logical outer boundary consistent with the existing character of the LAMIRD. Appropriate and necessary levels of public facilities and services not otherwise provided in rural areas may be provided inside the logical outer boundary.

(C) The logical outer boundary must be delineated primarily by the built environment as it existed on the date the county became subject to the planning requirements of the act.

(I) Some vacant land may be included within the logical outer boundary provided it is limited and does not create a significant amount of new development within the LAMIRD.

(II) Construction that defines the built environment may include above or below ground improvements. The built environment does not include patterns of vesting or preexisting zoning, nor does it include roads, clearing, grading, or the inclusion within a sewer or water service area if no physical improvements are in place. Although vested lots and structures built after the county became subject to the act’s requirements should not be considered when identifying the built environment, they may be included within the logical outer boundary as infill.

(III) The logical outer boundary is not required to strictly follow parcel boundaries. If a large parcel contains an existing structure, a county may include part of the parcel in the LAMIRD boundary without including the entire parcel, to avoid a significant increase in the amount of development allowed within the LAMIRD.

(D) The fundamental purpose of the logical outer boundary is to minimize and contain the LAMIRD. Counties should favor the configuration that best minimizes and contains the LAMIRD to the area of existing development as of the date the county became subject to the planning requirements of the act. When evaluating alternative configurations of the logical outer boundary, counties should determine how much new growth will occur at build out and determine if this level of new growth is consistent with rural character and can be accommodated with the appropriate level of public facilities and public services. Counties should use the following criteria to evaluate various configurations when establishing the logical outer boundary:
(I) The need to preserve the character of existing natural neighborhoods and communities;

(II) Physical boundaries such as bodies of water, streets and highways, and land forms and contours;

(III) The prevention of abnormally irregular boundaries; and,

(IV) The ability to provide public facilities and public services in a manner that does not permit low-density sprawl.

(E) Once a logical outer boundary has been adopted, counties may consider changes to the boundary in subsequent amendments. When doing so, the county must use the same criteria used when originally designating the boundary. Counties should avoid adding new undeveloped parcels as infill, especially if doing so would add to the capacity of the LAMIRD.

PLANNING ASSUMPTIONS

The Board adopted a number of planning assumptions in 2014 that have guided the comprehensive plan update. These are shown in Exhibit A.

BOCC PRINCIPLES AND VALUES

The Board also discussed a number of principles and values at work sessions held in the spring of 2014. These are shown in Exhibit B.